

Message Text

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 BRASIL 00221 01 OF 03 111453Z
ACTION ARA-10

INFO OCT-01 EUR-12 IO-13 ISO-00 ERDA-05 CIAE-00 H-01
INR-07 L-03 NSAE-00 OIC-02 OMB-01 PA-01 PM-04 PRS-01
SAJ-01 SP-02 SS-15 USIA-06 TRSE-00 DODE-00 NSC-05
ACDA-07 EB-07 NRC-05 OES-06 FEAE-00 COME-00 /115 W
-----111539Z 005454 /53

R 111230Z JAN 77
FM AMEMBASSY BRASILIA
TO SECSTATE WASHDC 9519
INFO AMEMBASSY BONN
AMEMBASSY THE HAGUE
AMEMBASSY LONDN
AMEMBASSY MOSCOW
AMEMBASSY BUENOS AIRES
USMISSION IAEA VIENNA
USMISSION EC BRUSSELS

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 1 OF 3 BRASILIA 0221

EO 11652 GDS
TAGS: TECH, ENRG, PARM, BR
SUBJECT: BRAZILIAN NUCLEAR DEBATE: GERMAN AMBASSADOR TO BRAZIL
COMMENTS

REF: (A) BRASILIA 0009, (B) 75 BONN 10706, (C) 76 BRASILIA 9622

1. SUMMARY. RECENT PUBLIC REMARKS BY WEST GERMANY'S
AMBASSADOR TO BRAZIL CAME ACROSS IN THE PRESS AS HAVING A CHALLENG-
ING AND DEFIANT TONE WITH RESPECT TO "INTERNATIONAL PRESSURES"
AGAINST THE BRAZIL-GERMAN AGREEMENT. THEY ALSO SEEMED TO IMPLY
THAT THE US SOUGHT TO DENY NUCLEAR ENERGY TO LDCE. THE GERMAN
AMBASSADOR REPORTEDLY DENIED THAT THE DUTCH HAVE "BOYCOTTED"
URENCO URANIUM FOR BRAZIL. THE GERMAN EMBASSY HAS CLAIMED TO US
THAT THE PRESS DISTORTED THE AMBASSADOR'S REMARKS.
THE GERMAN EMBASSY'S EXPLANATION IS PLAUSIBLE, IN OUR JUDGMENT,
BUT THE GERMAN AMBASSADOR COULD HAVE AVOIDED MISINTERPRETATION
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 BRASIL 00221 01 OF 03 111453Z

BY DECLINING TO COMMENT. THE AMBASSADOR PASSED UP AN EXCELLENT
OPPORTUNITY TO CLARIFY HOW THE FRG WOULD REACT WERE BRAZIL TO
DETONATE A NUCLEAR DEVICE. ON BALANCE, IT SEEMS TO US THAT THE
FRG AND ITS EMBASSY HERE ARE CONTINUING AN UNHELPFUL LINE; GERMAN
DISTORTIONS OF US MOTIVES AND OBJECTIVES CONTINUE TO APPEAR IN THE
BRAZILIAN PRESS.
END SUMMARY.

2. AMBASSADOR RODING'S PREPARED ADDRESS, ACCORDING TO THE TEXT GIVEN TO US BY THE GERMAN EMBASSY, CONTAINED THE FOLLOWING REMARKS ON NUCLEAR ISSUES:

"THE CONCERNS OVER THE ABUSE OF NUCLEAR ENERGY FOR DESTRUCTIVE PURPOSES ARE VERY UNDERSTANDABLE GIVEN THE DANGEROUS NATURE OF THE MATERIAL. THE GERMAN-BRAZILIAN AGREEMENT REFERS EXPRESSLY TO COOPERATION IN THE FIELD OF PEACEFUL USES OF NUCLEAR ENERGY. THE TWO PARTIES DECLARED THEMSELVES COMMITTED TO THE PRINCIPLE OF NON-PROLIFERATION OF NUCLEAR ARMS, HAVING SUBMITTED THEIR COOPERATION, MOREOVER, TO THE CONTROL OF THE IAEA IN ORDER TO GUARANTEE THAT THE MATERIALS, EQUIPMENT, INSTALLATIONS AND RESPECTIVE TECHNOLOGICAL INFORMATION WILL NOT BE UTILIZED FOR NUCLEAR ARMS OR OTHER NUCLEAR EXPLOSIVES." (COMMENT. RODING'S PORTUGUESE WORD FOR "COMMITTED" (SOLIDARIAS) TO THE PRINCIPLE OF NON-PROLIFERATION OF NUCLEAR ARMS IS CONSISTENT WITH ARTICLE TWO OF THE GERMAN TEXT OF THE FRG-GOB AGREEMENT (REF B), BUT IS STRONGER THAN THE FORMULATION IN THE PORTUGUESE TEXT OF THE AGREEMENT "TO BE IN FAVOR OF" (PARTIDARIAS).)

3. RODING'S REMARKS IN THE QUESTION-AND-ANSWER PERIOD CAME ACROSS IN THE PRESS, PERHAPS DISTORTEDLY (SEE PARAS 7-12), AS HAVING A CHALLENGING AND DEFIANT TONE WITH RESPECT TO INTERNATIONAL PRESSURES AGAINST THE AGREEMENT. ACCORDING

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 BRASIL 00221 02 OF 03 111447Z
ACTION ARA-10

INFO OCT-01 EUR-12 IO-13 ISO-00 ERDA-05 CIAE-00 H-01
INR-07 L-03 NSAE-00 OIC-02 OMB-01 PA-01 PM-04 PRS-01
SAJ-01 SP-02 SS-15 USIA-06 TRSE-00 DODE-00 NSC-05
ACDA-07 EB-07 NRC-05 OES-06 FEAE-00 COME-00 /115 W
-----111535Z 005399 /53

R 111230Z JAN 77
FM AMEMBASSY BRASILIA
TO SECSTATE WASHDC 9520
INFO AMEMBASSY BONN
AMEMBASSY THE HAGUE
AMEMBASSY LONDON
AMEMBASSY MOSCOE
AMEMBASSY BUENOS AIRES
USMISSION IAEA VIENNA

USMISSION EC BRUSSELS

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 2 OF 3 BRASILIA 0221

TO O ESTADO DE SAO PAULO (JAN. 5), WEST GERMANY WILL NOT GIVE IN, "EITHER UNDER THE PRESSURES OF INTERNATIONAL PUBLIC OPINION, OR OF INTERNAL GERMAN OPINION". RODING REPORTEDLY DENIED FIRMLY THAT US PRSSURES COULD RESULT IN A "NEW FORMULA FOR INTERNATIONAL SURVEILLANCE" (FISCALIZACAO, WHICH CAN ALSO MEAN CONTROLS OR INSPECTION DEPENDING ON THE CONTEXT). "THE IAEA WILL CONTINUE TO BE THE LEGAL FORUM FOR SURVEILLANCE OF THE AGREEMENT." GAZETA MERCANTIL ALSO REPORTED THAT RODING PLEDGED THE AGREEMENT WILL BE MAINTAINED, BUT GAZETA CLAIMED RODING DID NOT BELIEVE THE US HAD OR WOULD LEVY PRESSURES AGAINST THE AGREEMENT.

4. RODING REPORTEDLY ACKNOWLEDGED THE NONPROLIFERATION CONCERNS IN THHE US AND HE SAID "WE REGARD AS IMPORTANT" THE PRESIDENT-ELECT'S VIEWS, BUT HE COUNTERED THAT THE FRG-GOB AGREEMENT IS "ALMOST A MODEL". THIS SAID, HE APPARENTLY DECIDED TO DIFFERENTIATE GERMAN AND US MOTIVES: "THE CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 BRASIL 00221 02 OF 03 111447Z

AGREEMENT REVEALS THAT THE GERMAN GOVERNMENT FAVORS THAT DEVELOPING AND INDUSTRIALIZED COUNTRIES HAVE EQUAL POSSIBILITIES FOR USING MODERN SOURCES OF ENERGY." IN A SIMILAR VEIN, "ECONOMIC ADVISORS" TO RODING REPORTEDLY TOLD O ESTADO THAT: "INTERNATIONAL PRESSURES REFLECT THE FEAR OF A NEW ATOMIC PARTNER, EVEN IF IT IS DEDICATED EXCLUSIVELY TO THE PEACEFUL USE OF ENERGY."

5. URENCO FUEL. JORNAL DO BRASIL REPORTED THAT RODING SAID HE DID NOT BELIEVE THE DUTCH HAD "BOYCOTTED" URENCO FUEL FOR BRAZIL AND NEWS REPORTS TO THE CONTRARY "WERE NOT VERY CORRECT". HIS REMARKS ABOUT THE IMPLICATIONS OF A DUTCH OR BRITISH NO-VOTE, AS O ESTADO CONVEYED THEM, WERE UNCLEAR ON WHETHER WEST GERMANY ALONE COULD SUPPLY URENCO FUEL. DUTCH "POLITICAL PROBLEMS" DID NOT EXIST FOR WEST GERMANY, BUT DUTCH AND BRITISH OPPOSITION WOULD MEAN THAT "PROBLEMS WOULD EXIST WHICH WOULD NEED TO BE RESOLVED."

6. JORNAL DO BRASIL REPORTED THAT RODING SAID "WEST GERMANY AS WELL AS THE IAEA WILL PERFORM A FULL SURVEILLANCE OF POSSIBLE WORK WHICH BRAZIL, MORE PRECISELY THE INSTITUTE OF MILITARY ENGINEERING, UNDERTAKES WITH A VIEW TOWARD THE DEVELOPMENT OF NUCLEAR ARMS USING THE PLUTONIUM YIELDED BY REACTORS, OR WITH HEAVY WATER."

7. GERMAN EMBASSY CLARIFIES - GERMAN EMBASSY ECONOMIC COUNSELOR DIECKMANN CAME AT HIS REQUEST TO SEE THE DCM ON JANUARY 5, IN ORDER TO CORRECT WHAT DIECKMANN SAID WERE HIGHLY MISLEADING OR

ERRONEOUS PRESS ACCOUNTS. DIECKMANN STATED THAT HIS AMBASSADOR
WOULD HAVE PREFERRED NOT TO DEAL WITH THE QUESTION OF
THE NUCLEAR AGREEMENT AT ALL, BKM THERE APPEARED TO BE LITTLE
CHANCE THAT HE COULD ESCAPTE THE SUBJECT. HE THEREFORE PREPARED AND
DELIVERED A LENGTHY MONOLOGUE ON GERMAN-BRAZILIAN ECONOMIC
RELATIONS ACROSS THE BOARD, HOPIN
ITHEREBY TO PREEMPT THE BULK
OF HIS TIME. ONLY A HALF PAGE OF HIS 9-1/2 PAGE (DOUBLE SPACED)
SPEECH WAS DEVOTED TO NUCLEAR COOPERATION, AND THE STRESS IN
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 BRASIL 00221 02 OF 03 111447Z

THIS PARAGRAPH WAS LAID ESPECIALLY ON THE SAFEGUARD ARRANGEMENTS
EMBODIED IN THE BILATERAL AND TRILATERAL AGREEMENTS, AND ON THE
FRG-GOB PUBLIC COMMITMENT TO THE PRINCIPLE OF NONPROLIFERATION
OF NUCLEAR ARMS.

8. DIECKMANN SAID AN EFFORT WAS MADE IN THE QUESTION-AND-
ANSWER PERIOD TO PIN THE AMBASSADOR DOWN ON THE QUESTION OF
THE FRG'S DETERMINATION TO MAINTAIN THE BRAZIL-FRG NUCLEAR
PACK INVIOLETE, RESISTING ALL PRESSURES FROM THE US.
THE AMBASYGDOR AVOIDED FURNISHING A YES-OR-NO RESPONSE TO SUCH
QUESTIONS, DIECKMANN CLAIMED, BUT REPLIED WITH A REPETITION OF
THE THEME CONTAINED IN HIS PREPARED REMARKS. DESPITE THE AMBASSA-
DOR'S SHYING AWAY FROM A YES-OR-NO ANSWER TO THIS QUESTION, HOW-
EVER, THE PRESS DESCRIBED HIM AS HAVING RESPONDED AFFIRMATIVELY,
WITH A FLAT EXPRESSION OF GERMAN'S INTENTION TO STAND FIRM.

9. THERE WAS A "RATHER STRANGE" QUESTION, DIECKMANN SAID,
ON WHETHER THE FRG WOULD AGREE TO THE ESTABLISHMENT OF A MULTILATERAL
BODY INCLUDING REPRESENTATION FROM THE
U.S. TO OVERSEE THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE FRG-BRAZIL

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 01 BRASIL 00221 03 OF 03 111513Z
ACTION ARA-10

INFO OCT-01 EUR-12 IO-13 ISO-00 ERDA-05 CIAE-00 H-01
INR-07 L-03 NSAE-00 OIC-02 OMB-01 PA-01 PM-04 PRS-01
SAJ-01 SP-02 SS-15 USIA-06 TRSE-00 DODE-00 NSC-05
ACDA-07 EB-07 NRC-05 OES-06 FEAE-00 COME-00 /115 W
-----111535Z 005715 /53

R 111230Z JAN 77
FM AMEMBASSY BRASILIA
TO SECSTATE WASHDC 9521
INFO AMEMBASSY BONN
AMEMBASSY THE HAGUE
AMEMBASSY LONDON
AMEMBASSY MOSCOW
AMEMBASSY BUENOS AIRES
USMISSION IAEA VIENNA
USMISSION EC BRUSSELS

C O N F I D E N T I A L SECTION 3 OF 3 BRASILIA 0221

ARRANGEMENTS. (THE WORD WHICH THE QUESTIONER USED AND WHICH WAS PICKED UP LIBERALLY IN PRESS ACCOUNTS OF THE SPEECH WAS "FISCALIZAR".) THE AMBASSADOR'S RESPONSE TO THIS QUESTION WAS THAT THERE ALREADY EXISTS AN INTERNATIONAL AGENCY BOUND BY THE TERMS OF THE AGREEMENT TO OVERSEE ITS IMPLEMENTATION: THE IAEA. AGAIN, HOWEVER, ACCORDING TO DIECKMANN, THE AMBASSADOR'S RESPONSE WAS DISTORTED IN PRESS ACCOUNTS, WHICH STATED THAT HE HAD PHRASED HIS RESPONSE IN TERMS OF A REFUSAL TO ACCEPT A U.S. ROLE AS OVERSEER.

10. STILL ANOTHER QUESTION WAS WHETHER THE GERMAN GOVERNMENT WOULD BE ABLE TO WITHSTAND BOTH NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL PRESSURES FOR A CHANGE IN THE AGREEMENT WITH BRAZIL. HERE AMBASSADOR RODING CHOSE TO FURNISH A RESPONSE DIRECTED SOLELY AT DOMESTIC PRESSURES. HE REPLIED THAT, AS IS WIDELY KNOWN, THERE IS A GOOD DEAL OF DOMESTIC SENTIMENT IN THE FRG AGAINST THE FURTHER CONSTRUCTION WITHIN THE COUNTRY OF NUCLEAR FACILITIES OF ANY
CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 02 BRASIL 00221 03 OF 03 111513Z

KIND. ACKNOWLEDGING SUCH DOMESTIC SENTIMENT, HE SAID HE FELT IT WAS UNLIKELY TO RESULT IN ANY CHANGE IN THE BRAZIL-FRG AGREEMENT.

ONCE MORE THE AMBASSADOR'S RESPONSE WAS CAST ERRONEOUSLY, AS A STRONG REJECTION OF ALL PRESSURES, BOTH INTERNAL AND INTERNATIONAL, FOR A CHANGE IN THE ARRANGEMENTS.

11. RE PARA 6 ABOVE, DIECKMANN SAID A REPORTED ASKED RODING WHETHER BRAZIL-GERMAN NUCLEAR COOPERATION WOULD BE AFFECTED IF BRAZIL PRODUCED A BOMB.

RODING ANSWERED THAT IAEA CONTROLS WILL MONITOR FULLY THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE AGREEMENT. THE JORNAL DO BRASIL REORTEER, ACCORDING TO DIECKMANN, APPARENTLY INTERPRETED THIS TO MEAN THAT IAEA SURVEILLANCE WILL APPLY TO THE WORK OF THE INSTITUTE OF MILITARY ENGINEERING.

12. SUMMARIZING, DIECKMANN SAID HIS AMBASSADOR IN PREPARED REMARKS AND IN RESPONSE TO THE QUESTIONS, HAD BEEN VERY CAREFUL TO AVOID

CRICICISM OF THE ATTITUDE OF THE US TOWARD THE FRG-BRAZIL AGREEMENT. UNFORTUNATELY, THE IRRESPONSIBLE PRESS REPORTING OF HIS RESPONSES DID NOT REFLECT THIS CONCERN.

13. COMMENT. GIVEN THE FREQUENT SENSATIONALISM AND SLOPPINESS OF THE BRAZILIAN PRESS, DIECKMANN'S EXPLANATIONS ARE CERTAINLY PLAUSIBLE. THE DIFFERENCES IN THE PRESS ACCOUNTX LEND CREDENCE TO THE HYPOTHESIS OF PRESS DISTORTIONS. ON THE OTHER HAND, IT SEEMS TO US THAT AMBASSADOR RODING PROBABLY COULD HAVE EXERCISED GREATER CARE IN HIS COMMENTS, SUCH AS BU REFUSING TO COMMENT ON QUESTIONS DEALING WITH "INTERNATIONAL PRESSURES" AND US ATTITUDES. INDEED, THE AMBASSADOR COULD HAVE AVOIDED THE PRESS CONFERENCE ALTOGETHER, IN VIEW OF THE CERTAINTY THAT THE NUCLEAR QUESTION WOULD BE THE PRIME TOPIC ADDRESSED. THE FRG, IN OUR OPINION, NEVER HAS BEEN OVERLY RESTRAINED IN DEALING WITH THE PRESS ON THE QUESTION OF THE BRAZILIAN AGREEMENT, NOR HAS THE GERMAN EMBASSY HERE.

CONFIDENTIAL

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 03 BRASIL 00221 03 OF 03 111513Z

14. PERHAPS MORE IMPORTANT THAN RODING'S CARELESSNESS WAS HIS FAILURE TO TAKE ADVANTAGE OF THE REPORTER'S QUESTION ABOUT THE BOMB TO MAKE ABSOLUTELY CLEAR WHAT WOULD BE THE FRG'S RESPONSE WERE BRAZIL TO DETONATE A NUCLEAR DEVICE, WHETHER OR NOT FROM RESOURCES INVOLVED IN THE AGREEMENT.

15. EVEN IF ONE WERE TO TAKE AF FACE VALUE ALL OF DIECKMANN'S EXPLANATIONS, SEVERAL OTHER PRESS COMMENTS STILL SUGGEST A NOT FULLY RESPONSIBLE GERMAN APPROACH. WE REFER SPECIFICALLY TO RODING'S INSINUATION THAT THE US WOULD KEEP NUCLEAR ENERGY (AS OPPOSED TO ITS SENSITIVE ASPECTS) FROM LDCS. IN THE SAME CATEGORY IS THE ALLEGATION BY RODING'S "ECONOMIC ADIVOSRS" ABOUT FEARS OF A NEW ATOMIC PARTER. ON BALANCE IT SEEMS TO US THAT THE FRG AND ITS EMBASSY HERE CONTINUE TO PURSUE AN UNHELPFUL LINE; GERMAN DISTORTIONS OF US MOTIVES AND OBJECTIVES CONTINUE TO APPEAR IN THE BRAZILIAN PRESS. (REF C REPORTED ANOTHER EXAMPLE.)
CRIMMINS

CONFIDENTIAL

NNN

Message Attributes

Automatic Decaptioning: X
Capture Date: 01-Jan-1994 12:00:00 am
Channel Indicators: n/a
Current Classification: UNCLASSIFIED
Concepts: NUCLEAR SAFEGUARDS, PEACEFUL USES OF ATOMIC ENERGY, NUCLEAR FUELS, INTERGOVERNMENTAL COOPERATION, DIPLOMATIC DISCUSSIONS
Control Number: n/a
Copy: SINGLE
Sent Date: 11-Jan-1977 12:00:00 am
Decaption Date: 01-Jan-1960 12:00:00 am
Decaption Note:
Disposition Action: RELEASED
Disposition Approved on Date:
Disposition Case Number: n/a
Disposition Comment: 25 YEAR REVIEW
Disposition Date: 22 May 2009
Disposition Event:
Disposition History: n/a
Disposition Reason:
Disposition Remarks:
Document Number: 1977BRASIL00221
Document Source: CORE
Document Unique ID: 00
Drafter: n/a
Enclosure: n/a
Executive Order: GS
Errors: N/A
Expiration:
Film Number: D770010-0538
Format: TEL
From: BRASILIA
Handling Restrictions: n/a
Image Path:
ISecure: 1
Legacy Key: link1977/newtext/t19770164/aaaacebv.tel
Line Count: 319
Litigation Code IDs:
Litigation Codes:
Litigation History:
Locator: TEXT ON-LINE, ON MICROFILM
Message ID: 9b212fdb-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Office: ACTION ARA
Original Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Original Handling Restrictions: n/a
Original Previous Classification: n/a
Original Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Page Count: 6
Previous Channel Indicators: n/a
Previous Classification: CONFIDENTIAL
Previous Handling Restrictions: n/a
Reference: 77 BRASILIA 9, 75 BONN 10706, 76 BRASILIA 9622
Retention: 0
Review Action: RELEASED, APPROVED
Review Content Flags:
Review Date: 15-Nov-2004 12:00:00 am
Review Event:
Review Exemptions: n/a
Review Media Identifier:
Review Release Date: n/a
Review Release Event: n/a
Review Transfer Date:
Review Withdrawn Fields: n/a
SAS ID: 3628590
Secure: OPEN
Status: NATIVE
Subject: BRAZILIAN NUCLEAR DEBATE: GERMAN AMBASSADOR TO BRAZIL COMMENTS
TAGS: TECH, ENRG, PARM, BR, GE
To: STATE
Type: TE
vdkgvwkey: odbc://SAS/SAS.dbo.SAS_Docs/9b212fdb-c288-dd11-92da-001cc4696bcc
Review Markings:
Margaret P. Grafeld
Declassified/Released
US Department of State
EO Systematic Review
22 May 2009
Markings: Margaret P. Grafeld Declassified/Released US Department of State EO Systematic Review 22 May 2009